

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

January 22, 2026

Re: Roof / Window / Fire Escape Protection Review – Adjacent Construction

Property: 336 East 56th Street, Manhattan, NY 10022

Owner: Claude Simon

Dear Claude,

We are in receipt of a five (5) sheet plan set titled “336 East 56th Street – Roof / Window / Fire Escape Protection Plan,” consisting of Drawings EQ-001.00 through EQ-005.00, prepared by Eric Foster, PE / Ashraf Corporation, in connection with the adjacent renovation work at 1011 First Avenue, New York, NY 10022.

Per your request, MB Architect, PC has reviewed the submitted drawings for the limited purpose of evaluating proposed roof protection and adjacent building protection measures associated with construction activities at 1011 First Avenue, where such work occurs within twenty (20) feet of the subject property at 336 East 56th Street. This review is limited to Phases 1 and 2 of the adjacent project and is based on applicable NYC Building Code requirements governing the protection of adjoining properties.

EQ-001.00 – Roof Protection Site Plan

1. Sheet Content / Existing Conditions

- This sheet functions primarily as a site/plot plan and does not fully reflect existing conditions at the rear of 336 East 56th Street.
- For protection coordination purposes, revise to show existing rear-yard conditions at 336 East 56th Street, including:
 - The raised concrete platform (approximately 36 inches)
 - Existing equipment and level changes
- These conditions affect temporary protection layout, bearing conditions, and potential impacts to the subject building.

2. Roof Protection Plan – Insufficient for Protection Review

- EQ-001.00 does not provide a complete roof protection plan for 336 East 56th Street and is not at a scale suitable to evaluate impacts to the subject building.
- Provide a separate, dedicated roof protection plan at a larger scale, for review by the Architect of 336 East 56th Street, showing:
 - All existing and proposed beam sizes
 - Beam layout and directions
 - Support and bearing locations

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

- Limits of roof protection coverage

- Provide all information required to evaluate potential loading, bearing, and protection of the existing roof and structure of 336 East 56th Street.

3. Roof Access / Egress

- No roof access path or egress route is shown for 336 East 56th Street.
- As drawn, temporary protection appears to fully obstruct the roof, effectively eliminating roof access.
- Clarify, for protection of the subject building:
 - Whether roof access will be maintained, and if so, show the path of travel and required clearances, or
 - Whether roof access will be temporarily closed, and identify the duration and limits of closure.

4. Sidewalk Shed – Extended Projection

- Sidewalk shed adjacent to the neighboring hotel property is shown extending approximately 20 feet, exceeding the typical 5-foot projection.
- Clarify the basis for this extended projection as it relates to construction activities at 1011 First Avenue.

5. Coordination with Sections

- Roof protection framing shown diagrammatically on EQ-001.00 does not clearly coordinate with roof protection sections shown on EQ-003.00.
- The revised roof protection plan shall align with framing, supports, and limits shown in section views to allow review of impacts to 336 East 56th Street.

EQ-002.00 – Elevations / Adjacent Protection

1. Temporary Protection Adjacent to 336 East 56th Street

- Elevations show temporary protection, scaffolding, and debris netting adjacent to 336 East 56th Street.
- Clarify, for protection purposes:
 - Whether any temporary elements bear on, attach to, or impose loads on 336 East 56th Street.

2. Window Protection

- Show window protection at all exposed front-facing windows of 336 East 56th Street

3. Exterior Fire Escape Protection– Incomplete Representation

- Elevations do not show the exterior fire stairs at 336 East 56th Street, which are shown with debris netting on EQ-003.00.
- Revise elevation to include front exterior fire stairs at 336 East 56th Street and clearly indicate all proposed protection measures.

4. Fire Stair Protection – Overhead vs. Netting

- Elevations show debris netting adjacent to the subject building; however, it is unclear whether the exterior fire stairs (front and rear) are protected by:

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

- Overhead protection, or
 - Netting only
- Clarification required, for protection of egress components as per NYC Building Code Chapter 33 section §3307 & §3309:
 - Confirm whether overhead protection is provided at exterior fire Escapes and doors, or
 - Confirm netting-only protection and provide the code basis for this approach.

5. Separate Rear Elevation Requested

- Existing rear conditions and temporary protection are not clearly legible in the current elevation views.
- Provide a separate rear elevation showing:
 - Existing conditions at 336 East 56th Street
 - Exterior fire stair
 - Proposed protection measures (netting, overhead protection, scaffold proximity)

EQ-003.00 – Sections / Protection Details

1. Rear Yard Scaffold – Bearing & Tiebacks

- Sections show scaffold and overhead protection in the rear yard adjacent to 336 East 56th Street.
- Clarify, for protection of the subject building:
 - Whether the scaffold is free-standing or tied
 - Identify tie-back locations and receiving structures
- Confirm no tiebacks or anchorage to 336 East 56th Street.

2. Roof Protection Framing Over Existing Roof

- Sections indicate existing steel dunnage with new aluminum framing added to extend roof protection.
- Clarify the load transfer path to demonstrate that added framing does not overstress the existing roof or structure of 336 East 56th Street.

3. Fire Escape Protection

- Debris netting is shown at the front and rear exterior fire escapes of 336 East 56th Street.
- Clarify whether exterior fire escapes are protected by overhead protection or netting only.
- Confirm that protection measures:
 - Do not impose loads on the existing fire escape structures, and
 - Do not restrict operation, width, or headroom of required egress components including the 1st floor exit door on the rear of the building

4. Existing Rear Yard Conditions

- Sections indicate grade differences and a raised platform; however, existing conditions are not consistently shown across sheets.
- Revise sections to reflect actual rear-yard conditions, including:
 - Raised platform
 - Cellar level

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

- Stair connection from first floor to rear yard
- Confirm where temporary protection bears or is supported.

EQ-004.00 – Roof & Window Protection Details

1. Roof Protection Assembly – Attachment & Bearing

- Details do not clearly indicate:
 - Whether temporary wood planking or framing is fastened to the existing roof
 - Whether loads bear on roof slab, joists, beams, or existing dunnage
- Clarify attachment and bearing conditions to confirm protection of the existing roof assembly and waterproofing of 336 East 56th Street.

2. Structural Capacity (Protection of Existing Building)

- No documentation is provided demonstrating that the existing roof structure of 336 East 56th Street can support:
 - Temporary beams
 - Decking
 - Scaffold-related loads
- Provide structural verification or reference to engineered analysis for protection of the subject building.

3. Scaffold Tiebacks

- Tieback requirements are not clearly identified.
- Confirm whether scaffold stabilization is provided by:
 - 1011 First Avenue, and/or
 - Adjacent structures (Hotel)
- Confirm no ties or anchors to 336 East 56th Street unless separately detailed and authorized.

4. Existing Roof Construction

- Roof construction is shown as concrete.
- Previously issued existing drawings indicate wood joist roof construction at 336 East 56th Street.
- Revise all sections and details to reflect the correct existing roof construction, and
- Provide roof protection details (Sections 2 & 3) showing insulation, membrane, and separation over wood joist framing.

EQ-005.00 – General Notes

1. Applicability to Adjacent Occupied Building

- General notes reference NYC Building Code Chapter 33 but are written broadly.
- Clarify that all temporary protection measures shown or referenced are intended to protect adjacent occupied buildings, including 336 East 56th Street, during construction at 1011 First Avenue.

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

2. No Reliance on 336 East 56th Street for Temporary Works

- General notes do not explicitly state whether temporary protection systems rely on adjacent buildings.
- Add a note stating that no temporary protection, scaffolding, roof protection framing, or stabilization shall bear on, attach to, or be anchored to 336 East 56th Street unless separately engineered, detailed, and authorized.

3. Exterior Fire Stairs / Egress Protection

- General notes do not explicitly address protection of exterior fire stairs serving 336 East 56th Street. Add a note stating that:
 - Exterior fire stairs and required egress components shall be protected from falling debris during adjacent construction; and
 - Temporary protection shall not obstruct, reduce, or impair required egress width, headroom, or operability.

4. Existing Conditions Coordination

- General notes do not acknowledge that protection details are dependent on verified existing conditions.
- Add a note requiring coordination with existing conditions at 336 East 56th Street, including:
 - Roof construction type
 - Rear-yard grade changes and raised platforms
 - Presence of cellar and exterior stair connections

5. Notes vs. Drawings Hierarchy

- General notes reference protection requirements but do not establish hierarchy.
- Add clarification that, where protection of 336 East 56th Street is concerned, specific plans, sections, and details shall govern over general notes.

6. Responsibility Clarification

- General notes include contractor responsibility language.
- Confirm that no responsibility, liability, or duty is assigned to the Owner of 336 East 56th Street for adjacent construction means, methods, or temporary works.

Conclusion / Limitation of Review

The above comments are provided for the limited purpose of identifying items requiring clarification, revision, or additional information in order to evaluate compliance with applicable NYC Building Code Chapter 33 requirements for the protection of adjoining properties.

This review is based solely on the documents submitted and does not constitute approval of the means, methods, sequencing, or safety procedures of construction, all of which remain the sole responsibility of the Owner, Contractor, and their design professionals for the project at 1011 First Avenue.

MB ARCHITECT PC

Mohammed Betatache, RA

214-41 42nd Avenue, Suite 4F, Bayside New York, 11361

Phone: (516) 850-1255 | Email: mbetatache@mbarchitect.com | Website: www.mbarchitect.com

Nothing herein shall be construed as a certification of structural adequacy, waterproofing performance, constructability, or code compliance of the proposed temporary protection systems, nor as an acceptance of responsibility for the design, installation, maintenance, or performance of such systems.

Implementation of any temporary protection measures shall be coordinated with verified existing conditions at 336 East 56th Street, and any deviations from the reviewed drawings or conditions observed in the field may require additional review.

All construction activities at 1011 First Avenue shall include any and all temporary protection measures required to protect the adjoining property at 336 East 56th Street and to comply with applicable NYC Building Code requirements, whether or not such measures are explicitly shown on the reviewed drawings.

Review of the submitted drawings will continue upon receipt of revised plans addressing the above comments. Please provide a written response to each comment and submit revised drawings with all changes clearly bubbled and dated for ease of review.

Sincerely,

Mohammed Betatache, RA

A handwritten signature in black ink, appearing to read 'M. Betatache', with a stylized flourish at the end.